

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF CANVASSERS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 3, 2024 AT 1:00 P.M.
42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM
NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Rodney L. Pepe-Souvenir
*Secretary Frederic M. Umane

Commissioners Jose M. Araujo, Michael J. Coppotelli, Gino A. Marmorato, Jodi Morales, Simon Shamoun, Michele A. Sileo

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director

Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager

Michael D. Corbett, Administrative Manager

Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners

Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel

Eric Butkiewicz, Associate General Counsel

Tom Sattie, Director – Candidate Records Unit

Troy Johnson, Coordinator – Candidate Records Unit

Sherwin Suss, Agency Chief Contracting Officer

New York County: Stephen M. Evans III, Chief Clerk
Rhonda Evans, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk

Bronx County: Brendaliz Candelaria, Deputy Chief Clerk
Elizabeth English, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk

Kings County: Salvatore Barrera, Acting Chief Clerk
Daniel Ortiz, Deputy Chief Clerk

Queens County: Amanda Berinato, Chief Clerk
Bart J. Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk

Richmond County: Daniel Lavelle, Chief Clerk
Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk

*Commissioner Umane appeared remotely, but not at a publicly accessible location, and therefore did not cast any votes.

Mr. Ryan called the meeting to order, and then turned the meeting over to President Pepe-Souvenir to convene a Meeting of the Board of Canvassers, in the City of New York, to certify the results of the November 5, 2024 General Election.

Pursuant to the provisions of Title 2 of Article 9 of the New York State Election Law, President Pepe-Souvenir called the meeting of the Board of Canvassers in the City of New York to order, for the purpose of certifying the canvass of votes cast for the General Election held on November 5, 2024.

President Pepe-Souvenir designated Commissioner Araujo to serve as the other Democratic Member of the Canvassing Board, and Commissioner Marmorato designated Commissioner Shamoun as the other Republican Commissioner to serve as a member of the Canvassing Board.

Commissioners appearing remotely have been provided with a copy of the Returns of Canvass in advance.

The New York County Borough Managers, Stephen Evans, Chief Clerk and Rhonda Evans, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, introduced themselves for the record.

The Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk of Manhattan and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the General Election held on November 5, 2024, in accordance with this Board's policies.

The Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval.

The Manhattan Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of the poll site and central count scanners required by Article 9 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed.

Based on that report, Commissioner Marmorato moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 5, 2024 General Election conducted in New York County. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The Returns of Canvass prepared and submitted by the Manhattan Staff of the Board of Elections were adopted unanimously.

Secretary Umame thanked the Manhattan Borough Managers and staff for their hard work in getting this done. And on behalf of his fellow Commissioner

who could not be here today, the Commissioner asked the Borough Managers express their thanks for their hard work and service to the city, tell them thank you for all of their hard work.

The Bronx County Borough Managers, Brendaliz Candelaria, Deputy Chief Clerk and Elizabeth English, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, introduced themselves for the record.

The Deputy Chief Clerks of the Bronx and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the General Election held on November 5, 2024 in Bronx County, in accordance with this Board's policies and procedures.

The Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval.

The Bronx Deputy Chief Clerks confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of the poll site and central count scanners required by Article 9 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed.

Based on that report, Commissioner Marmorato moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 5, 2024 General

Election conducted in Bronx County. Commissioner Morales seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The Returns of Canvass prepared and submitted by the Bronx Staff of the Board of Elections were adopted unanimously.

Commissioner Marmorato thanked President Pepe-Souvenir, and on behalf of the wonderful people of the Borough of the Bronx, as well as all the Commissioners, he expressed heartfelt gratitude to their steadfast Deputy Chief Clerk, Brendaliz Candelaria, and a special thank you to their Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Ms. Elizabeth English, who will be retiring this year after 17 years of service. The Commissioner thanked both Ms. Candelaria and Ms. English, along with the tremendous staff, for their hard work, diligence and making the Bronx very proud. Commissioner Morales stated that she seconded everything Commissioner Marmorato said and also thanked the staff.

The Kings County Borough Managers, Salvatore Barrera, Acting Chief Clerk, and Daniel Ortiz, Deputy Chief Clerk, introduced themselves for the record.

The Acting Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Brooklyn and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the General Election held on

November 5, 2024 in Kings County, in accordance with this Board's policies and procedures.

The Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval.

The Brooklyn Acting Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of the poll site and central count scanners required by Article 9 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed.

Based on that report, Commissioner Shamoun moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 5, 2024 General Election conducted in Kings County. Commissioner Araujo seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The Returns of Canvass prepared and submitted by the Brooklyn Staff of the Board of Elections were adopted unanimously.

President Pepe-Souvenir thanked Mr. Barrera and Mr. Ortiz for all the work they've done, and all the staff at the VMF and BOE Office. The Commissioner stated that she knows that they have worked tirelessly to ensure that this election

was well run and asked that they express their appreciation to the staff for all of their efforts. Commissioner Shamoun stated that he concurs and echoes those sentiments. It was a nice election event, through no doubt, the hard work of all of the workers in the office and on the ground, on Election Day and leading up to and expressed his gratitude.

The Queens County Borough Managers, Amanda Berinato, Chief Clerk, and Bart Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk, introduced themselves for the record.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Queens and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the General Election held on November 5, 2024 in Queens County, in accordance with this Board's policies and procedures.

The Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval.

The Queens Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of the poll site and central count scanners required by Article 9 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed.

Based on that report, Commissioner Araujo moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 5, 2024 General Election conducted in Queens County. Commissioner Marmorato seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The Returns of Canvass prepared and submitted by the Queens Staff of the Board of Elections were adopted unanimously.

Commissioner Araujo stated that he would like to take this opportunity, on behalf of himself and Commissioner Sullivan, to thank the staff for their hard work.

The Richmond County Borough Managers, Daniel Lavelle, Chief Clerk, and Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, introduced themselves for the record.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Staten Island and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the General Election held on November 5, 2024 in Richmond County, in accordance with this Board's Policies.

The Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval.

The Staten Island Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of the poll site and central count scanners required by Article 9 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed.

Based on that report, Commissioner Coppotelli moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 5, 2024 General Election conducted in New York County. Commissioner Sileo seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The Returns of Canvass prepared and submitted by the Staten Island Staff of the Board of Elections were adopted unanimously.

Commissioner Coppotelli, on behalf of himself and Commissioner Sileo, extended their thanks to the staff, Mr. Andriulli and Mr. Lavelle as well as all the staff in the borough office and certainly the General Office who worked to make this possible. Commissioner Sileo seconded the sentiment by Commissioner Coppotelli and noted that the staff is always wonderful and outstanding and thanked them from the bottom of her heart.

Commissioner Araujo moved to approve and adopt the Recap Statement and Return of Canvass for those Districts which cross borough lines. Commissioner Marmorato seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The motion was adopted and the Recap Statements and Return of Canvass for those Districts which cross borough lines in the General Election conducted on November 5, 2024 were approved.

Commissioner Araujo moved to authorize the use of the Commissioners' electronic signatures as needed and appropriate on each Statement and Return of Canvass. Commissioner Marmorato seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The motion was adopted.

Commissioner Shamoun moved to adjourn the Meeting of the Board of Canvassers, in the City of New York for 2024. Commissioner Coppotelli seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

The meeting of the Board of Canvassers was adjourned.

Mr. Ryan continued with item #2 of the meeting agenda, the approval of the minutes of the November 26, 2024 Commissioners Meeting.

Hearing no objections or amendments, the minutes of the November 26, 2024 Commissioners Meeting were adopted.

Mr. Ryan continued with item #3 of the meeting agenda, which was tabled from last week, an Update on the November 5, 2024 General Election. Mr. Ryan stated that it's an update on the election which we have now certified but will do it as abbreviated as he can.

Mr. Ryan provided the following update:

The election occurred on November 5, 2024. 1,211 poll sites were opened. The results, which we just announced, will be available on the website if not by close of business today, then by close of business tomorrow for sure. The results will be posted in the normal machine-readable format, as well as PDF and a CSV file, which is essentially an Excel file, and that's available in an AD and ED breakdown for all contests.

There were 89,835 pieces of voting equipment distributed over the 1,211 poll sites. 544 sites required some temporary remediation including temporary

ramps and lifts to be in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. 36,545 poll workers were assigned to work on election day, and we are still processing payroll so that number could go up based on verification. We received 3,439 calls on election day from voters requesting assistance. We had 792,340 hits on the Find Your Poll Site application for election day, as well as about 100,000 hits to our new election day Wait Time Map, and we hope that that's a tool that will continue to grow over the course of time and people find it useful. Mr. Ryan also noted that we were able to track the use of either the Fast Pass Tag, which is the physical tag, or the wallet, which is a virtual tag that goes into your wallet on your cell phone. 598,967 voters chose to check in using one of those two methods on election day. We hope that continues to take off as well, as that will undoubtedly speed the check in time at the poll sites.

Mr. Ryan stated that the rest of the stuff that we were going to report on last week regarding pending certification is no longer necessary since we've now certified the election so that concludes item #3 of the meeting agenda.

President Pepe-Souvenir stated that she wanted to take the time to thank Georgea Kontzamanis, Operations Manager, for all her efforts during the elections. The Commissioner stated that she was really impressed with how Ms. Kontzamanis worked with all the Chief Clerks and Deputy Clerks, ensuring that this was a very smooth election. A lot of the things that Executive Director

Michael Ryan just discussed was a lot of the brainchild of her inputting and putting into place to make this a great election, and the Commissioner wanted to stand out and say thank you so much. Commissioner Shamoun echoed President Pepe-Souvenir's sentiments and noted that sometimes we just take things for granted because that just happen, more recently than not, and thanked everyone, thanked Ms. Kontzamanis and said to keep doing what she's doing. Mr. Ryan thanked Ms. Kontzamanis as well and noted his appreciation.

Mr. Ryan continued with item #4 of the meeting agenda, a Report from the Finance Committee.

Mr. Ryan acknowledged Sherwin Suss, the Agency Chief Contracting Officer, to present these matters. Mr. Ryan noted that this was an item that was also tabled from last week due to a time issue.

Mr. Suss informed the Commissioners that last week there were four items presented to the Finance Committee for their consideration and review, and all of them were approved by the Committee to go forward to the general meeting.

President Pepe-Souvenir asked that Mr. Suss present them all together, describe each of the different contracts, and then the Commissioners will make their recommendation all at once.

Mr. Suss presented the following:

Sage Smith

This is the outside vendor who programs and maintains the S-Elect Systems for the Board. These include applications for poll worker management, poll site management, inventory management, Election Day worker and Poll Site locator. The contract provides for maintenance of the systems and upgrading of the applications as needed or requested. This contract was obtained through negotiated acquisition pursuant to PPB Rule 3-04. The contract is a four-year contract with a two-year renewal at the option of the Board under the same terms and conditions. The not to exceed amount for the four years is \$6,750,000.

N-Tier

This is the outside vendor who programs and maintains the AVID System applications for the Board. These include voter registration rolls, online voter registration, online absentee ballot requests, online voter lookup and importing the DMV voter registration information into the AVID system. The contract provides for maintenance of the systems, upgrades, and support to MIS and all borough offices. The contract was obtained through negotiated acquisition pursuant to PPB Rule 3-04. The contract is a four-

year contract with a two-year renewal at the option of the Board under the same terms and conditions. The not to exceed amount for the four years is \$9,384,832.

Awe Huh Creative Services

This is the contract to provide the stylus pens used at all poll sites for signing poll pads and completing the ballots. The original contract was for 10,000,000 pens at .125 per pen for a not to exceed amount of \$1,250,000. This is a four-year contract from 6/30/22 to 6/29/26. Due to the number of unanticipated special elections, 8,000,000 pens have already been purchased under the contract. The final 2,000,000 have already been ordered as there is a 3-month manufacturing and shipping time frame. As the Board is only just past half the contract term the request is to increase the amount of pens to be purchased to a total of 20,000,000 and increase the contract ceiling by another \$1,250,000 for a total new not to exceed amount of \$2,500,000. This will only be spent if the pens are purchased.

Gov Connection Inc.

This is a contract to provide maintenance and 24/7 support to the Board's backup retention systems agency wide. This is a continuation of the project approved by the Commissioners at the meeting of June 13, 2023, for the purchase of hardware and configuration of the new retention system which

allowed the Board to meet NYS and NYC retention policies. For that procurement, a bidding process was completed, and the lowest priced vendor was selected. That project was completed. This is a 3-year contract for maintenance and support for this system with the awarded vendor. This is an intergovernmental procurement using Sourcewell which is a government cooperative purchasing agency operated by the State of Minnesota of which the Board is a member. The 3 year not to exceed amount of this contract is \$193,701.

President Pepe-Souvenir thanked Mr. Suss for his presentation, and stated that the Finance Committee had the opportunity to review these items last week and after much consideration and questions regarding the contracts, they do recommend that we go with these contracts for the different services and products.

Secretary Umame noted that since it is a committee report a motion is not needed. President Pepe-Souvenir confirmed that the recommendation of the Finance Committee was unanimous.

Hearing no objections, the Finance Committee Report was adopted unanimously.

Mr. Ryan continued with item #5 of the meeting agenda, Challenges to Voter Registrations NYSEL §5-220.

Mr. Ryan stated that the Manhattan Borough Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Mr. Evans and Ms. Evans, have some reports on 7 previous voter challenges as well as a recommendation for 2 new voter challenges under NYSEL §5-220.

President Pepe-Souvenir administered the challenge oath to Mr. Evans and Ms. Evans from §5-220 of the NYS Election Law, and they both signed the challenge oath form.

The Legal Department confirmed that the challenge oath is sufficient to cover the two new voter challenges that the Manhattan Borough Managers will present.

Mr. Evans stated that the Board received a voter registration for Victor Susana, DOB 12/31/1987 and VSN# 414652904. The reason for the challenge is that the address listed is Trump Tower, the apartment nomenclature used on the application does not match the way the actual numbering system for Flores and Trump Tower operate. They did not include any of the required identification of social security number or driver's license number as required by state and federal

law, and the handwriting was similar to, and the date in which they received it, from other registration forms received during the same time period. It is for these reasons the Manhattan Borough Managers are challenging this registration. Secretary Umame inquired about the political party in which the person was trying register, and Mr. Savino confirmed that it was for the Republican party.

Mr. Evans presented the second challenge to the voter registration of Mirriam Hoffman, DOB 12/31/1984 and VSN# 414652409. Mr. Evans stated that essentially it is the same situation, an address in Trump Tower where the apartment numbering does not actually match the way that apartments are numbered in Trump Tower, did not provide a social security or driver's license number, handwriting similar and date received is similar to other registrations received around the same time and for these reasons the Manhattan Borough Managers are challenging this registration.

Secretary Umame stated that he cannot vote on it, but he would move to ask the Manhattan Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk to do the proper investigation and report back to the Commissioners.

Hearing no objections, the motion was carried.

The Manhattan Borough Managers continued their report on the 7 previous voter challenges.

Mr. Evans stated that at the October 15, 2024 meeting, a person named Octavio Sacasa challenged the voter registration of Laurie Sternberg. The Manhattan Borough Managers sent a bipartisan team to the address on her voter registration at 334 West 87th Street, Apt. 6C. The name on the doorbell for Apt. 6C was Mr. Sacasa's name. The team rang the doorbell and Mr. Sacasa confirmed that no one named Laurie Sternberg lived there, and the team also spoke with the building Super who also said that she had not lived there in 10 years. It was the bipartisan conclusion of the team that no one named Laurie Sternberg presently lives at that address.

Mr. Evans stated that the registration of Alberto Gonzalez was challenged on September 24, 2024. A bipartisan team was sent to the address listed on his registration, 650 West 42nd Street, Apt. 1413. When the bipartisan staff mentioned that apartment number, the building staff readily recognized that as the apartment number of a former tenant who tended to pull pranks and impersonate other people. The building staff confirmed that no one named Alberto Gonzalez lived there, and it was the bipartisan conclusion that Alberto Gonzalez does not live at that address.

The registration of Anna Rubin was also challenged on September 24, 2024, and her registration address was 721 5th Avenue, Apt. 2604. The doorman at the building said that no one by that name lives there, and also noted that the apartment numbering in the building would include both a floor number and a letter and it would not have a number like 2604. It was the conclusion of the bipartisan team Anna Rubin does not live there.

Mr. Evans stated that the exact same thing happened with Christophen Joshua's registration, also challenged on September 24, 2024, except 2601 was the apartment number. Again, the doorperson at that building indicated that no one by that name lives there and as for the floor numbering, there would not be a 2601 in that building.

Mr. Evans stated that the registration of Juan Merchan was also challenged on September 24, 2024. The bipartisan team went out to the address listed on his registration. There is no actual street address like that, but the building on that site is the same building that was previously mentioned with an apartment number 1413. And where again, that is an apartment that used to be occupied by someone who apparently has a history of impersonating other people and there is no Juan Merchan living there.

The registration of Majda Nalic was challenged on September 24, 2024. Mr. Evans stated that Ms. Nalic is also registered to vote at 721 5th Avenue, Apt. 2603. The doorman confirmed that no one by that name resides there, and again there would not be an apartment number 2603 in that building.

The registration of Peter Axelrod was challenged on September 24, 2024. Mr. Evans stated that for Peter Axelrod this is the exact same situation except that the apartment number was 2606. The doorman said no one by that name resides there, and 2606 would not be an apartment number in that building.

Mr. Ryan asked the Manhattan Borough Managers to provide their recommendation for these 7 voter challenges. Mr. Evans stated that it is their recommendation that all of the registrations be canceled. Ms. Evans concurred.

Secretary Umane moved to cancel the 7 voter registration records. President Pepe-Souvenir seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

Mr. Ryan confirmed, hearing no objections, the motion carries, and those 7 individuals will be removed from the voter rolls by direction of the Commissioners.

Secretary Umane thanked the New York County staff for doing a thorough investigation into these 7 plus 2 situations and asked that the Manhattan Borough Managers thank the people involved on behalf of the Commissioners.

Mr. Ryan added item #6 to the meeting agenda, Personnel Matters.

The date of the next meeting of the Commissioners is to be determined.

Commissioner Shamoun moved to adjourn the open meeting and convene an Executive Session to discuss Personnel Matters. Commissioner Marmorato seconded the motion, which was adopted unanimously.

Following the Executive Session the open meeting resumed.

Mr. Ryan stated that there were 5 personnel matters that will be reported in the minutes as required by law.

The meeting was adjourned.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners of Elections is to be determined.