

MEETING OF THE
COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON TUESDAY, DECEMBER 16, 2014
AT 1:30 P.M.
42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM
NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Jose Miguel Araujo
 Secretary Michael Michel

Commissioners Ronald Castorina, John Flateau, Bianka Perez, Michael Rendino, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel
Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Kate Doran, LWV
 John D. Smith
 Michael Benjamin
 Katharine Loving, CFB
 Celeste Katz, NY Daily News
 Cathy Gray
 Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Committee

President Araujo called the meeting to order at 1:41 P.M.

Commissioner Schulkin moved to adopt the minutes for the November 25, 2014 and December 2, 2014 meetings. Commissioner

Flateau seconded the motion, with Commissioners Rendino, Castorina and Umane abstaining on the December 2, 2014 minutes. The motion was adopted. Commissioners Rendino, Castorina and Umane abstained because they were not present at that meeting.

Commissioner Schulkin requested to add an Executive Session for purposes of personnel.

Commissioner Flateau requested for a target date for the Board's 2015 agency plan. Ms. Sandow reported that the 2015 agency plan will be completed by mid-January.

Mr. Ryan reported on the Board's Testimony for the Assembly Standing Committee on Election Law Hearing which was held on Friday, December 12, 2014. Mr. Ryan and Ms. Sandow appeared before the Committee. Mr. Ryan clarified that the Public Hearing concerned the newly established campaign finance compliance unit within the New York State Board of Elections. After Mr. Ryan received clarification from the Assembly Committee, he reported to the Commissioners' Executive Committee, and the determination was not to prepare written remarks. Mr. Ryan informed the Assembly Committee that in September 2009,

campaign finance compliance was significantly diminished at the City Board. As an alternative, the Assembly Committee requested Board testimony concerning the 2014 elections. Mr. Ryan testified for a half-hour about the 2014 election cycle, the Board's Tablet Pilot Program, and ballot jam issues. Mr. Ryan noted that it was routine reporting at the Hearing.

Mr. Ryan reported on the Privacy Booth Reduction Pilot Program in Queens County. He recalled that the Queens Commissioners approved a pilot program for the 2014 September Primary to reduce the number of privacy booths; one privacy booth for every 300 registered voters, opposed to one privacy booth for every 250 registered voters. The pilot resulted in a decrease of 435 privacy booths being deployed in Queens. The average delivery cost in Queens is \$14.97 each, resulting in a decrease of approximately \$6,800 in shipping costs per election. The average delivery cost citywide is \$18.19 each. If the pilot program was expanded citywide, there would be a decrease of 1,857 privacy booths, resulting in a total cost savings of approximately \$35,000 per election. President Araujo noted that this pilot complies with Section 6210.19 of the NYS Election Law. The Board is still bound by one privacy booth for every 250 registered voters for general elections for governor, or at elections at which electors for President are selected. Commissioner Rendino inquired if Board staff

received feedback from the poll workers. President Araujo reported that he spoke to Queens Coordinators and they appreciated the reduction because there was more space in the poll site. Secretary Michel reported that he only received positive feedback as well. Executive Management reported that it was a successful pilot in Queens County and recommended to expand citywide in 2015. Mr. Ryan noted that the Privacy Booth Reduction Program could be revisited before each specific election. Commissioner Schulkin moved to expand the Privacy Booth Reduction Program citywide in 2015. Commissioner Castorina seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

There was a consensus among the Commissioners to schedule the next Commissioners' Meeting on January 6, 2015.

Mr. Ryan publicly welcomed back Troy Johnson, the Coordinator of the Candidate Records Unit.

The Commissioners convened Party caucuses.

After the caucuses concluded, President Araujo moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of personnel. The motion was seconded, and unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the public meeting resumed and President Araujo reported the following actions taken in Executive Session:

- I. The Commissioners granted 140 hours Advance of Time to Latrice Jones, a Voting Machine Technician in the Manhattan Office, to be paid back with her accruals upon her return;
- II. The Commissioners granted 140 hours Advance of Time to Nicole Traficenti, an Administrative Assistant in the Staten Island Office, to be paid back with her accruals upon her return.

President Araujo moved to adjourn the meeting. Secretary Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, January 6, 2015 at 1:30 P.M.