

MEETING OF THE
COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 25, 2014
AT 1:00 P.M.
42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM
NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Jose Miguel Araujo
 Secretary Michael Michel

Commissioners Ronald Castorina, John Flateau, Maria R. Guastella,
Bianka Perez, Michael Rendino, Alan Schulkin, Simon Shamoun,
Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel
Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel
Matthew Graves, Acting Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit
Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office
Lisa Sattie, Administrative Associate, Staten Island Office
Anthony Ribustello, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office
Marricka Scott-McFadden, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office
Bart Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Queens Office
Robert Pataky, Administrative Associate, Queens Office
BettyAnn Canizio, Deputy Chief Clerk, Brooklyn Office
Salvatore Barrera, Administrative Associate, Brooklyn Office
Gregory Lehman, Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office
Alvin Samuels, Acting Deputy Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners
Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Kate Doran, LWV
 Cathy Gray
 Paul Marks, NYC Law Department
 Ben Stockman, NYC Law Department
 Chris Bowiat, NYC Law Department

Emily Forgione, CFB
Henry E. Nass
Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Committee

President Araujo called the meeting to order at 1:02 P.M.

President Araujo moved to convene an Executive Session for purposes of litigation. Commissioner Guastella seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Following Executive Session, the open public meeting resumed and President Araujo reported the following actions taken in Executive Session:

- I. The Commissioners unanimously granted 420 hours Discretionary Advance of Time to Eida Santiago, a Clerk in the Brooklyn Office, retroactive to November 9, 2014. Ms. Santiago has been employed with the Board since September 17, 2000.
- II. The Commissioners appointed Marilyn Velez, a Temporary Clerk in the Executive Office, to Voting Machine Technician with an annual salary of \$30,088.

Pursuant to the provisions of Title 2 of Article 9 of the New York State Election Law, President Araujo called the meeting of the Board of Canvassers in the City of New York to order for the purposes of certifying the recanvass of votes cast on November 4, 2014 in the General Election conducted within the City of New York.

To serve as the other Democratic Member of the Canvassing Board, President Araujo designated Commissioner Guastella for the respective counties and to serve with him for Queens County, and any multi-county recaps.

President Araujo noted that Secretary Michel and Commissioner Rendino joined the meeting.

To serve as the other Republican Member of the Canvassing Board, Secretary Michel designated Commissioner Umane for the respective counties and to serve with him for Queens County, and any multi-county recaps.

The Deputy Chief Clerks of the Bronx and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General

Election conducted in Bronx County. The signed Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Ribustello and Ms. Scott-McFadden confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Rendino moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in Bronx County. Commissioner Perez seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Brooklyn and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in Kings County. The signed Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Ms. Canizio and Mr. Barrera, on behalf of Ms. Rudiano, confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these

contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Flateau moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in Kings County. Commissioner Shamoun seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Acting Deputy Chief Clerk of Manhattan and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in New York County. The signed Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Lehman and Mr. Samuels confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Schulkin moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in New York County. Commissioner Umane seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Queens and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 4,

2014 General Election conducted in Queens County. The signed Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Haggerty and Mr. Pataky, on behalf of Ms. Conacchio, confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there was one (1) discrepancy to report to the Board, and the audit of voter verifiable audit records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. A detailed Discrepancy Report which is fully explainable is attached to the Returns of Canvass. Based on that report, President Araujo moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in Queens County. Secretary Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The Chief Clerk and Deputy Chief Clerk of Staten Island and their staff have prepared and signed the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in Richmond County. The signed Returns of Canvass were presented to the Canvassing Board for review and approval. Mr. Andriulli and Ms. Sattie, on behalf of Ms. DelGiorno, confirmed that the results presented are accurate and correct, there are no discrepancies to report to the Board, and the audit of voter verifiable audit

records for both the poll site and central count scanners required by Section 9-211 of the New York State Election Law has been successfully completed for these contests. Based on that report, Commissioner Castorina moved that the Board of Canvassers certify the Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election conducted in Richmond County. Commissioner Guastella seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

On behalf of the Commissioners, President Araujo thanked all Borough Office staff for their hard work.

Commissioner Umane moved to approve and adopt the Recap Statements and Returns of Canvass for the November 4, 2014 General Election for those Offices which cross county boundaries within the City of New York. Commissioner Guastella seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Umane moved to authorize the use of the Commissioners' signature stamps as appropriate on each Statement and Return of Canvass. Commissioner Guastella seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Commissioner Castorina moved to adjourn the meeting of the Board of Canvassers and to convene the weekly stated meeting of the Commissioners of Elections in the City of New York. Secretary Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

President Araujo recognized Harry Nass, a member of the public, who inquired about write-in votes.

Commissioner Guastella moved to approve the November 18, 2014 minutes. Secretary Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

Mr. Ryan provided notification that the 100th Annual Election Commissioners' Association (ECA) Winter Conference is scheduled from Monday, January 12, 2015 through Thursday, January 15, 2015. Once the ECA's agenda is finalized, Executive Management will request authorization from the Commissioners on staff attendance.

Mr. Ryan reported that he received an invitation to testify before the Assembly Standing Committee on Election Law at a Public Hearing scheduled on Friday, December 12, 2014 at 10:00 A.M. A copy of the

invitation is in the agenda. The Hearing concerns the newly established compliance unit within the New York State Board of Elections. Mr. Ryan questioned what role the City Board would have on this unit in the State Board. Mr. Ryan will contact Assembly Member Cusick to see exactly what input they need from the City Board, and will report back next week with further clarification. Commissioner Umame recommended for the Board to attend the Hearing. The Commissioners tabled this item for one (1) week.

President Araujo recognized Alan Flacks, a member of the public, who recommended new Visitor I.D. labels and presented a sample to the Commissioners.

Commissioner Umame moved to adjourn the meeting. Secretary Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners will be held on Tuesday, December 2, 2014 at 1:30 P.M.