

HEARINGS ON DESIGNATING PETITIONS AND RELATED MATTERS
FOR THE SEPTEMBER 9, 2014 PRIMARY ELECTION AND
THE MEETING OF THE COMMISSIONERS OF ELECTIONS
IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK
HELD ON TUESDAY, JULY 29, 2014
AT 10:00 A.M.
42 BROADWAY, 6th FLOOR, COMMISSIONERS' HEARING ROOM
NEW YORK, NY 10004

PRESENT: President Jose Miguel Araujo
 Secretary Michael Michel

Commissioners Ronald Castorina, Julie Dent, Maria R. Guastella, Michael Rendino, Simon Shamoun, Frederic M. Umane

Michael J. Ryan, Executive Director
Dawn Sandow, Deputy Executive Director
Pamela Perkins, Administrative Manager
Steven H. Richman, General Counsel
Raphael Savino, Deputy General Counsel
Giacomo Kmet, Contract Attorney
Anibal Luque, Contract Attorney
David Inkeles, Law Student Intern
Michael Forsette, Law Student Intern
Valerie Vazquez, Director, Communications & Public Affairs
Anthony Andriulli, Deputy Chief Clerk, Staten Island Office
Anthony Ribustello, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office
Marricka Scott-McFadden, Deputy Chief Clerk, Bronx Office
Gregory Lehman, Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office
Alan Schulkin, Deputy Chief Clerk, Manhattan Office
Robert Pataky, Administrative Associate, Queens Office
Bart Haggerty, Deputy Chief Clerk, Queens Office
Nina M. Crispino, Director, Personnel
Matthew Graves, Acting Coordinator, Candidate Records Unit
Michael Carmicino, Administrative Assistant, Candidate Records Unit
Michael Neglia, Associate Staff Analyst, Candidate Records Unit
Thomas Sattie, Associate Staff Analyst, Candidate Records Unit
Ryan Deahn, Administrative Assistant, Candidate Records Unit
Kenneth Moltner, Counsel to the Commissioners

Steven B. Denkberg, Counsel to the Commissioners

GUEST: Steven Isler
Manny Cavaco
Gary Carsel
Tom Wrobleski, SI Advance
Pamela Hamilton-Johnson
John S. Sailor
Paige Bellenbaum
Shanine Kirby
Johnella Hill
Carlton Curry
Pinky Prue Camille
Gail Gaelsden
Raven Robinson
Liam McCabe
Elliot Quinones
Blanca Rojas
Maryeleen Jimenez
Garth Marchant
Liz Robins, for CM Kallos
John S. Sailor
Egidio Sementilli, for Jones
Press, Bronx News
Ed Brady
Steve Behan
Anna Maria-Thomas
Tom McNeil
Stanley Schlein
Eric Schultz, DOI
Soo Jihu, Citizens Union
McKirby
John Smith
Gibbs
Skurnik
Vanel
Michael Benjamin
Keith Lilly
Jordan Salzar
William R. More
Andrew Cohen

Nat Johnson
Bill Perkins
Jason Habor
Diaz Agustin, for Melanie Hidalgo
Katherine James
Rubin Varga
Jerry Goldfeder
David Gruenberg, for Conigliano & O'Hare
Alan Flacks, Member of NY County Democratic Committee
Fred Brown
Martin Connor
Pierre A. Kantue
Frank Bolz
H. Parekh
Chris Bolz
Arthur Gwub
Alex Pardes
Michael R.
LaSandra M.
Poinvil, for Moore
Bah Elthy, for Brown
Everly Brown
Rebecca Sheehan, for Avella
Bryant Graham, for Brown

President Araujo called the meeting to order at 10:05 A.M.

President Araujo announced that the Commissioners would conduct the Hearings on challenges to Designating Petitions for State and Local Offices as well as Party Positions to be contested in the September 9, 2014 Primary Election. President Araujo stated the procedures to be followed

during the Hearings and called upon Mr. Richman to call the Calendar for the Hearings.

Mr. Richman reported that in accordance with the Commissioners' direction, notice was given to all interested and necessary parties concerning the Public Hearings to consider the Board's staff preliminary findings of Prima Facie Defects, Candidate Enrollment Issues, as well as Specifications of Objections, and other concerns relating to the September 9, 2014 Primary Election.

Mr. Richman called the Calendar for the Hearings on Designating Petition matters for Richmond County. He noted that the Calendar was posted for the public as required.

Mr. Richman presented the Legal Prima Facie Report for Richmond County. There were no appearances. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Graves presented the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report for Richmond County. There were no appearances. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report on

file at the Board.

Mr. Richman called the Specifications of Objections for Richmond County. There was an appearance by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon.

President Araujo announced that the Commissioners will recess until the stated Meeting of the Commissioners scheduled at 1:00 P.M. He added that the Commissioners will be holding a Commissioners' Finance Committee Meeting with Executive Management during the recess.

After recess, President Araujo called the Meeting of the Commissioners to order at 1:00 P.M.

Commissioner Dent moved to approve the minutes for the July 22, 2014 meeting. Secretary Michel seconded the motion, with Commissioner Castorina abstaining. The motion was adopted. Commissioner Castorina noted that he abstained because he was not present at that meeting.

Commissioner Umane reported that the Commissioners held a Finance Committee Meeting during the recess to review and discuss the ES&S Contract Agreement which was presented by Mr. Ryan at the previous meeting. The Commissioners' Finance Committee recommended authorizing Mr. Ryan to sign the ES&S Contract Agreement on behalf of the Commissioners. The contract is an allocation of \$20,300,000 for up to two (2) years. Commissioner Umane noted that the Board does not have to spend the entire allocated amount. The full Board unanimously adopted the Commissioners' Finance Committee's recommendation.

President Araujo moved to adjourn the meeting of the Commissioners. Secretary Michel seconded the motion, which was unanimously adopted.

The next stated meeting of the Commissioners is scheduled on Tuesday, August 5, 2014 at 1:30 P.M.

President Araujo reconvened the Hearings on Designating Petitions and related matters for the September 9, 2014 Primary Election at 1:30 P.M. President Araujo stated the procedures to be followed during

the Hearings and called upon Mr. Richman to call the Calendar for the Hearings.

Mr. Richman called the Calendar for the Hearings on Designating Petition matters for Bronx County. He noted that the Calendar was posted for the public as required.

Mr. Richman presented the Legal Prima Facie Report for Bronx County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Graves presented the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report for Bronx County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Graves presented the CRU Prima Facie Report for Bronx County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

The Bronx Deputy Chief Clerks submitted a memorandum to the Commissioners stating that the following Specifications of Objections have been determined by the respective Deputy Chief Clerks and Commissioners of the Bronx Borough Office to comply with Rule H12:

- BX4 Latoya Joyner
- BX7 Latoya Joyner
- BX72 Pamela Hamilton-Johnson
- BX73 Raul Rodriguez
- BX74 Raul Rodriguez
- BX93 Mohammed Jan
- BX94 Mohammed Jan
- BX95 Rosa Velasquez
- BX96 Rosa Velasquez
- BX97 Ricardo F. Martinez

- BX98 Ricardo F. Martinez
- BX99 Khadijah Saeed
- BX100 Khadijah Saeed
- BX101 Fernando P. Tirado
- BX102 Fernando P. Tirado

Mr. Savino called the Specifications of Objections for Bronx County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon.

Mr. Richman presented the Counsel's Report on Specification of Objections BX-69, Objections of Carol D. Jones to petition filed on behalf of Candidate Michael A. Blake. There were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Counsel's Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Counsel's Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Richman called the Calendar for the Hearings on Designating Petition matters for New York County at 2:30 P.M. He noted that the Calendar was posted for the public as required.

Mr. Richman presented the Legal Prima Facie Report for New York County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Graves presented the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report for New York County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Graves presented the CRU Prima Facie Report for New York County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the CRU Prima Facie Report

on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Richman called the Specifications of Objections for New York County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon.

Mr. Richman called the Calendar for the Hearings on Designating Petition matters for Queens County at 3:30 P.M. He noted that the Calendar was posted for the public as required.

Mr. Richman presented the Legal Prima Facie Report for Queens County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Legal Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Graves presented the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report for Queens County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a

candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the Candidate Enrollment Issues Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Graves presented the CRU Prima Facie Report for Queens County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on the CRU Prima Facie Report on file at the Board.

Mr. Richman called the Specifications of Objections for Queens County. In selected instances, there were appearances by a candidate and/or their representative which is noted on the Clerk's Report on file at the Board. The Commissioners' determinations are reflected on each Clerk's Report acted upon.

President Araujo moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded and unanimously adopted.